

CCFA E-Working Group (eWG) to consider the use of note 161.

Second circular – REPLY TABLE

FOR REPLY BY 19 OCTOBER 2013

<u>Respondent country/organisation:</u>	
--	--

Proposal One

That the electronic working group consider whether it is possible to address this difference by a new Note (Note X) to replace Note 161 in appropriate food categories. Participants are invited to agree, or disagree, with each of the options listed below and to offer comments on them, as well as making other proposals for the text of such a Note.

	Comments
<u>Note X: Option 1</u> <i>"To replace sugar wholly or partly, or in products where no sugar is added during manufacture."</i>	
<u>Note X: Option 2</u> <i>"Limited to products in which there is a significant reduction in energy from the use of the sweetener, or where no sugar is added during manufacturing."</i>	
<u>Note X: Option 3</u> <i>"Some countries limit use to products in which there is a significant reduction in energy from the use of the sweetener, or where no sugar is added during manufacturing."</i>	

Note X: Option 4 <i>“Use may be limited to products in which there is a significant reduction in energy from the use of the sweetener, or where no sugar is added during manufacturing.”</i>	
Note X: Option 5 <i>“Consistent with section 3.2 of the Preamble for additives to provide an advantage and not to mislead consumers, some countries limit use to products in which there is a significant reduction in energy from the use of the sweetener, or where no sugar is added during manufacturing.”</i>	
Note X: Other Options	

Proposal Two:

That, as water-based flavoured drinks (food category 14.1.4) are usually a very significant contributor to exposure:

- **Industry submit data on the required level of acesulfame-K and aspartame-acesulfame salt in category 14.1.4 and its subcategories 14.1.4.1 and 14.1.4.2.**
- **Participants submit evidence/information concerning exposure assessment in both adults and children to support their view that it is, or is not, a concern.**

and this information is requested by 19 October 2013.

COMMENTS in response to Proposal TWO:

Proposal three:

That eWG participants comment on the proposed way forward on each food category using the table below, saying whether you agree or disagree with the proposal. If you disagree with the proposed way forward, please provide information/evidence to support your view.

Food Category No.	Title	Options to continuing with Note 161	Comments from Participants
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X • Further evidence on levels of use as a <u>flavour enhancer</u> and sub-categories in which this is technologically justified is requested, to support inclusion of an additional specific Note. 	
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited use reported in non-standardised foods and inconsistent with Commodity Standards - Standard for a Blend of Evaporated Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat; and Standard for a Blend of Sweetened Condensed Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat. • Further evidence justifying use in this category is requested, otherwise the category will be discontinued. 	
01.4.4	Cream analogues	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited use reported by eWG. • Further evidence justifying use in this category is requested, otherwise the category will be discontinued. 	

01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited use reported by eWG. • Further evidence justifying use in this category is requested, otherwise the category will be discontinued. 	
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited use reported by eWG. and inconsistent with Commodity Standards - Group Standard for Unripened Cheese including Fresh Cheese, Standard for Mozzarella, Standard for Cottage Cheese incl. Creamed Cottage Cheese, Standard for Cream Cheese and General Standard for Cheese) • Further evidence justifying use in this category is requested, otherwise the category will be discontinued. 	
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited use reported by eWG. • Further evidence justifying use in this category is requested, otherwise the category will be discontinued. 	
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy based dessert products of food category 01.7	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	

03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.1.2.1	Frozen fruit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discontinue this provision. No technological justification. No use reported by participant countries of eWG, and inconsistent with Commodity Standards - Standard for Quick Frozen Strawberries, Standard for Quick Frozen Raspberries, Standard for Quick Frozen Peaches, Standard for Quick Frozen Bilberries and Standard for Quick Frozen Blueberries) 	
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discontinue this provision. No technological justification. Limited use reported by participant countries of eWG, and inconsistent with commodity standards falling under this category which do not allow sweeteners - Standard for Raisins, Standard for Dried Apricots and Standard for Grated Desiccated Coconut. 	
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with Note 144 (for use in sweet and sour products only). 	
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies and marmelades	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discontinue this provision (Technologically sugar is necessary for candied fruit and cannot be replaced by an intense sweetener.) 	

04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit flavoured water-based desserts	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.1.2.12	Cooked fruit	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.2.2.1	Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discontinue this provision. No technological justification. No use reported by participant countries of eWG, and inconsistent with Commodity Standards - Standard for Edible Fungi and Fungus Products, Standard for Quick Frozen Peas, Standard for Quick Frozen Spinach, Standard for Quick Frozen Leek, Standard for Quick Frozen Broccoli, Standard for Quick Frozen Cauliflower, Standard for Quick Frozen Brussels Sprouts, Standard for Quick Frozen Green and Wax Beans, Standard for Quick Frozen French Fried Potatoes, Standard for Quick Frozen Whole Kernel Corn, Standard for Quick Frozen Corn-on-the-Cob and Standard for Quick Frozen Carrots) 	

04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with Note “For use in dried seaweed only”. 	
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with Note 144 (for use in sweet and sour products only). 	
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited use reported in non-standardised foods and inconsistent with Commodity Standards - Standard for Preserved Tomatoes, Standard for Edible Fungi and Fungus Products, Standard for Canned Chestnuts and Chestnut Purée, Standard for Canned Bamboo Shoots and Standard for Certain Canned Vegetables. • Further evidence justifying use in this category is requested, otherwise the category will be discontinued. 	
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with Note “For use only in tomato jam.” 	

04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
04.2.2.8	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrops)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	

05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
05.2.1	Hard candy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
05.2.2	Soft candy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
05.2.3	Nougats and marzipans	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
05.3	Chewing gum	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X • Further evidence on levels of use as a <u>flavour enhancer</u>, to support inclusion of an additional specific Note. 	
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
07.1	Bread and ordinary bakery wares and mixes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discontinue this provision. Bread is a staple part of many diets. Technologically sugar is necessary for the production of bread and cannot be replaced by an intense sweetener. 	

10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
12.2.1	Herbs and spices	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discontinue this provision. No technological justification for use in this category. Limited use reported by participant countries of the eWG. 	
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited use reported by eWG members. • Further evidence justifying use in this category is requested, otherwise the category will be discontinued. 	
12.3	Vinegars	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discontinue this provision. No technological justification for use in this category. Limited use reported by participant countries of the eWG. 	
12.5	Soups and broths	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited use reported by eWG members. • Further evidence justifying use in this category is requested – including whether use is as a sweetener or flavour enhancer - otherwise the category will be discontinued. 	
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited use reported by eWG members. • Further evidence justifying use in this category is requested, otherwise the category will be discontinued. 	
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace 161 with new note X 	

14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Replace 161 with new note X.• (Reply also to <u>Proposal Two</u> above.)	
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Replace 161 with new note X	